



**SANTA CRUZ METROPOLITAN TRANSIT DISTRICT (METRO)
BOARD OF DIRECTORS AGENDA MEETING MINUTES
APRIL 22, 2016 – 8:30 AM
WATSONVILLE CITY CHAMBERS
275 MAIN STREET
WATSONVILLE, CA 95076**

A regular meeting of the Board of Directors of the Santa Cruz Metropolitan Transit District (METRO) was convened on Friday, April 22, 2016 at the Watsonville City Chambers, 275 Main Street, Watsonville, CA.

The Board Meeting Agenda Packet can be found online at www.SCMTD.com and is available for inspection at Santa Cruz Metro's Administrative offices at 110 Vernon Street, Santa Cruz, California.

This document has been created with accessibility in mind. With the exception certain 3rd party and other attachments, it passes the Adobe Acrobat XI Accessibility Full Check. If you have any questions about the accessibility of this document, please email your inquiry to accessibility@scmttd.com

SECTION I: OPEN SESSION

1 CALL TO ORDER at 8:38 AM by Chair Rotkin.

2 ROLL CALL: The following Directors were present, representing quorum:

Director Ed Bottorff	City of Capitola
Director Dene Bustichi	City of Scotts Valley
Director Karina Cervantez	City of Watsonville
Director Cynthia Chase	City of Santa Cruz
Director Jimmy Dutra, Vice Chair	City of Watsonville
Director Zach Friend	County of Santa Cruz
Director Norm Hagen	County of Santa Cruz
Director John Leopold	County of Santa Cruz
Director Bruce McPherson	County of Santa Cruz <i>Arrived @ 9:12AM</i>
Director Mike Rotkin, Chair	County of Santa Cruz
Ex-Officio Director Donna Blitzer	UC Santa Cruz <i>Arrived @ 8:45AM</i>

The following Director was absent:
Director Don Lane

City of Santa Cruz

STAFF PRESENT:

Alex Clifford
Leslyn K. Syren

METRO CEO/General Manager
METRO District Counsel

METRO EMPLOYEES AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO VOLUNTARILY INDICATED THEY WERE PRESENT (IN ALPHABETICAL ORDER) WERE:

Heather Adamson, AMBAG
Roberto Atilano
Elise Casby, Self/Riders/Community
Ce___, Castro, Self
Juan Corona
Nick Danty, Self
William C. Davis, Self, Cabrillo
Zachary Davis, Self, Cabrillo
Felipa de Leon
Jinx Derulsa
Veronica Elsea
Nancy Faulstich
Jennifer Figueroa
M. Fitzpatrick, Ops
Patricia Fohrman, Watsonville resident
Tom Fordman
Jose Luis Gadoy
Jane Gallagher
Mrs. Gomez, Self, Seniors, Disabled
Magdalena Gonzalez
Pauline J. Gringo
Lupe, G _____
Maria R. G___mon
Helen Hinorosa
Mary Jennings
Teresa Jimenez
Debbie Kinslow, SCMTD
Roxanne Kirkland
Maura Leonor, Community Life Svcs
Fabian Leonor
Noe Lona
Rick Longinotti
Deanna D. Lopez, Self
Louise
Juana Magana, JM
Sebastian Magana, Self
Miles Mancinelli, UCSC
Joseph Martinez, MAC
Mary Jane
Ignacio Mata, Self
Christopher Michael, Self, Cabrillo
Cynthia Molina, Self, Cabrillo

Eduardo Montesino
Maria L. Moron
Clint Nabor, Self
Nancy, Self
Irma Nolasco
Christina Oak___, Self
Ofelia Gomez
Brian Peoples, Train Now
Yolanda Perez
Aaron Quaday
Eduardo R.
Magdalena R.
Juan Ramirez
Paul Reese, Self
MW Regan, VMU SEIU
Bruce Rhodes
Tiffany Rodriguez, SJSU
Roy Rogers, Self
Michelle Saucedo
Ernestina Saldana
Susan Sanford
Rebecca Schiffrin
Peter Scott
Ayari Soto
Sharon Stanton, Community, Self
Nina Stratton
Estebarria Virairro Sedovia
Becky Taylor
Kathleen Taylor, Son
Melissa Tracy
Simone Valasco
Romeo Vidal, Self
Nahara Villalobos
Miriam Villalobos, Community Life Svcs
Edward F. Walker, Self
Watsonville Brown Berets, Community
Watsonville HS Special Needs Class
Andrew Wood, Self, SJSU
Daniel Zaragoza, METRO
Andrew Zuniga

SECTION I: OPEN SESSION

3 ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Rotkin reminded the assembly that there would be three meetings in May:

- May 13, 8:30AM Santa Cruz Chambers, 809 Center Street, Santa Cruz
- May 26, 5:00PM Watsonville City Chambers, 275 Main Street, Watsonville
CONTINUING TO
- May 27, 8:30AM Santa Cruz Chambers, 809 Center Street, Santa Cruz

Chair Rotkin introduced Carlos Landaverry and his Spanish Language Interpretation services. He then announced this meeting is being televised by Community Television of Santa Cruz County on Channel 26. Our technician today is Alex Saidi and our Watsonville City technician today is Tamara Vidas.

4 BOARD OF DIRECTORS COMMENTS

None.

5 COMMUNICATIONS TO THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS

In response to requests for public comment:

Brian Peoples referred everyone to his organization's website: TrailNow.org to educate themselves regarding the proposed tax measure.

Chair Rotkin clarified that SCCRTC is the author of the proposed tax measure, not METRO.

Unnamed woman, representing the Santa Cruz Chamber Players and the general public, had several comments regarding her experience with trains helping traffic congestion, etc. in the Los Angeles area.

6 WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS FROM MAC (if applicable)

Having none, the meeting proceeded to the next agenda item.

7 LABOR ORGANIZATION COMMUNICATIONS

Ex-Officio Director Blitzer arrived at 8:45AM

Eduardo Montesino, UTU representative, shared an article entitled, "Orange County's Bus Ridership Declines are Worst in SoCal" and a flyer currently being distributed at Cabrillo. (See attached.) He also asked to see any "numbers" related to furlough. The Union and management are discussing the merger of two positions to provide better customer service in Watsonville. This item will be brought to the Board in the near future.

Chair Rotkin thanked the Unions for their assistance.

Director Bustichi requested that Regular Agenda Item 14, Update on the Comprehensive Operational Analysis and Resolution Opening a 30-day Public comment Period Setting a Public Hearing for May 26, 2016 and May 27, 2016 be moved to the front of the agenda to accommodate the numerous attendees interested in speaking to this particular topic.

8 ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTATION TO SUPPORT EXISTING AGENDA ITEMS

Chair Rotkin announced the following items were distributed to Board Members and are available at the back of the room for public viewing:

- San Jose State Associated Students Letter
- News Clips: Media articles of interest

ACTION: MOTION TO BRING FORWARD ON THE AGENDA REGULAR AGENDA ITEM 14, UPDATE ON THE COMPREHENSIVE OPERATIONAL ANALYSIS AND RESOLUTION OPENING A 30-DAY PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD SETTING A PUBLIC HEARING FOR MAY 26, 2016 AND MAY 27, 2016, TO ALLOW ADEQUATE PUBLIC COMMENT TIME FOR THE NUMEROUS PUBLIC IN ATTENDANCE WHO ARE INTERESTED IN ADDRESSING THIS PARTICULAR TOPIC.

MOTION: DIRECTOR BUSTICHI

SECOND: DIRECTOR LEOPOLD

MOTION PASSED WITH 10 AYES (Directors Bottorff, Bustichi, Cervantez, Chase, Dutra, Friend, Hagen, Leopold, McPherson and Rotkin.) Director Lane was absent.

14 ACCEPT AND APPROVE: UPDATE ON THE COMPREHENSIVE OPERATIONAL ANALYSIS AND RESOLUTION OPENING A 30-DAY PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD AND SET PUBLIC HEARINGS FOR MAY 26, 2016 AND MAY 27, 2016

Chair Rotkin asked the assembly for their patience while listening to the proposals being presented today; METRO has been hard at work listening and incorporating requested changes.

Comment cards were displayed, explained and distributed by Barrow Emerson, Planning and Development Manager. He also reminded everyone that all updates and documents are available 24/7 on the website: SCmetroforward.com

Today METRO is requesting the Board adopt a resolution to open the 30-day public review period and set public hearing dates for May 26 and 27, 2016.

Director McPherson arrived at 9:12AM

Kristina Svensk, TMD, provided commentary to the presentation noting that specific cuts will not be addressed today as METRO and TMD are continuing to collect input and make revisions where possible.

District Counsel, Leslyn Syren, added that a more thorough Title VI analysis will be provided at the next board meeting.

Referring to page 14.3 of the board report, CEO Clifford informed the assembly that METRO is facing financial challenges on both the capital and operating sides of the business; e.g., a capital challenge over the next decade of over \$200M to maintain facilities, buses, etc. in a state of good repair, in addition to the \$6.4M structural deficit. This is not a one-year fix; but, an ongoing challenge. Today there are 70 buses which must be purchased incrementally to achieve a state of good repair. We will need to keep our STA and STIC funds in the operating plan until there is another plan to phase in these funds.

Chair Rotkin added that gas, sales tax and fare revenues have not kept up with increased costs. METRO's management expenses are lower than our industry peers. He stressed that no decisions will be made today; the final decision will be made in June.

Director Leopold inquired regarding service to the Freedom area health centers, noting that they didn't seem to be reflected in the current proposal. Mr. Emerson responded he would get back to Director Leopold with the requested information.

Based on the number of comment cards submitted and the number of speaker requests, Chair Rotkin asked that each speaker keep his/her comments to two minutes.

Chair Rotkin opened the floor to public comment:

Teresa Jimenez does not want to eliminate bus service; she uses the bus to go to the hospital, social security office, every where. The bus drivers help those in wheelchairs. (Spanish translation provided by Carlos Landaverry)

Nina Stratton asked the Board to consider how the proposed cuts to routes 4 and 91 would impact the low income community. The 91 is a vital corridor with a lot of affordable/Section 8 housing along the route. The 4 to Emeline services is vital.

Ofelia Gomez requested more education/information about the proposal and its affect to Cabrillo and the unincorporated areas. She takes route 91 to get from Santa Cruz to Watsonville and to the community hospitals.

Nick Danty, San Jose State Student, expressed concerns regarding Highway 17 "thinning". Chair Rotkin eased his concerns noting that this has been removed from the proposal based on input from METRO's transit partners.

Roxanne Kirkland expressed concern for the disabled along route 74 who may not be able to walk as far as the Transit Center to get to the hospital, social security office, Cabrillo, etc. She's observed full buses on route 69A. The proposed cuts to route 35 are too drastic.

Sharon Stanton understands the need for increased fares but expressed concern for the disabled, seniors, students and METRO employees.

Juan Corona expressed concern over proposed changes to route 4 to get to Emeline. He also took offense to the implication that the bus riding public can afford to utilize Uber when bus service is cut.

Director Bottorff clarified that the present proposal cuts one hour of service on route 4.

Mr. Emerson added, at the current time, there is no intent to eliminate service to Emeline; route 4 is currently under review.

CEO Clifford provided a more accurate definition of the 'uber-izing' reference to mean that METRO is investigating an on-demand type of service in those areas where fixed routes may be eliminated.

Jinx Derulsa supports a way to get out of the traffic which means more people in buses and not in cars.

Juan Ramirez takes route 75 to see his daughters and attend AA meetings. The current schedule allows him only 15 minutes for grocery shopping. He supports a small fare increase and suggested re-routing the 75 or 72 to go through Corralitos, Mesa Verde and Green Valley. (Spanish translation provided by Carlos Landaverry)

Yolanda Perez said cutting route 69A would result in economic impacts to the businesses in Santa Cruz; e.g., she would take the MST to Monterey to shop if that were to happen. Field workers use 71, 72, 75 and 74. Riders also use 4, 69A and 74 to get to medical clinics.

Jane Gallagher, spoke on behalf of Edward F. Walker, takes route 55 to work; rides 7 buses per week/13 routes per month. She cited Oakland as an example that charges double for their express routes.

Melissa Tracy spoke about service cuts in general and its effect on those who need the service most. She spends most of her day on the bus (71 to Highway 17) to get to school. She cited VTA's Measure A as an example to increase frequency and efficiency.

Louise, former METRO employee, rides route 74. Her disabled brother depends on the bus to get to the VA in Palo Alto from his home in Boulder Creek.

Rebecca Schiffrin, Watsonville resident, sees the riders on 69A and 69W enroute to the hospital. She is impressed by METRO's breadth of service.

Roberto Atilano suggested implementing commercial advertising at bus stops to increase revenue to METRO.

Elise Casby expressed skepticism as she hasn't seen any information on the pop-ups and has more questions. Combining routes 4 and 35 is not feasible.

Veronica Elsea, MAC Chair, expressed concerns about the May 26 Public Hearing and access via evening bus service.

Nancy Faulstich, Watsonville Climate Action Network, suggested METRO ask Santa Cruz's wealthy to donate money to continue service. Reducing service is the opposite of what we should do. She called on everyone to make a donation.

Felipa de Leon, Watsonville Independent Square resident, spoke regarding her experiences with routes 69A, 71 and 77 to the health center and other locations. The 74 needs a shelter. The sidewalks are not always suitable for wheelchairs; cars don't always look both ways and some have been struck.

Ernestina Saldana, Live Oak resident, has spoken with Mr. Emerson about her experience with full buses. The bus operators have no option but to skip those in wheelchairs; they cannot ask people to get off the bus to make room for the wheelchairs. More accidents may happen if they are on the street. Section 8 recipients live in rural areas and may be one of the first without service. (Spanish translation provided by Carlos Landaverry)

Maura Leonor has done bus training on METRO and experienced the challenges of riding the bus through her work with clients. The 79 weekend service will hamper their independence and remove access to a social life for those living along this route.

Miriam Villalobos needs the bus. The sidewalks along route 79 need to be repaired; they are dangerous.

Noe Lona hasn't seen any numbers and would like to know how many hours are represented in terms of drivers. The drivers deserve every penny and benefit they receive; they have an important job. He has gathered together a community which is ready to vote for non-support.

Rick Longinotti is ready to make transit a local priority through voting and taxes. On June 2nd, the RTC will make a decision. He encouraged the attendees to vote to repurpose the funds designated to widen Highway 1.

William Davis, Cabrillo student, opposes cutting route 91X cut as this would limit his class options. Many are reliant on the 74 and 69A to get to the hospital.

Simone Valasco has used the bus for the past 40 years. Her concern is for the disabled. The bus drivers provide a public service and do two jobs: assisting the disabled as well as driving the bus. Long term care providers and their patients depend on this service. (Spanish translation provided by Carlos Landaverry)

Becky Taylor takes routes 54/55 from Capitola to Cabrillo then to UCSC. Occasionally her housing decisions have been based on bus availability.

Eduardo Montesino, representing the bus operators, disagreed with the statement that ParaCruz will not be affected. He said there will be consequences to the Paratransit community: 3 operators will be affected; taxis are not reliable as a fill-in; riders will wait up to two hours to reach their destinations; and, Fixed Route will be less reliable and will leave wheelchair passengers behind because there will not be enough room to take them.

Christopher Michael, Cabrillo student, spoke of his experience with route 91: It's 1.5 to 2 times faster than the 71. He suggested METRO raise the fare 50 cents or \$5 more per month. Additionally requested advance notice of changes be posted.

Michelle Saucedo takes route 69W to 69A to her doctor in Watsonville, using a disability pass. She asked that Board members ride the bus to listen to the riders, observe the operators assist the passengers with their carts, etc.

Susan Sanford suggested METRO look for other funding sources; i.e., get involved with legislators at state and federal levels. She asked that the 79 not be cut on weekends.

Patricia Fohrman, Watsonville resident, rides buses all day every day. She perceives a lack of public input and thinks the Watsonville statistics are wrong. She hasn't heard of any Watsonville pop-ups. The proposed cuts will have an economic affect to businesses, riders, etc.

Mary Jennings called on the board to set an example for the rest of the country to think creatively and heroically find other funds so as not to make irrational cuts.

Peter Scott put in a word for summer weekend bus service to Big Basin and Waddell Creek beach. He urged METRO to do better with marketing and selling of its service to increase ridership.

Jennifer Figueroa, UCSC student, suggested using resource utilization to create a mobile app for private revenue to raise \$6.5M

Eduardo R. wants answers to a number of questions; e.g., what is the Board doing to personally communicate this information to the community, where can they give public input, etc.

Director Bustichi departed at 11:25AM

Before he departed, Director Bustichi asked the assembly to attend RTC's June 2nd meeting in Watsonville to voice any concerns regarding funding and allocated percentages.

Paul Reese wants to increase the routes to increase ridership; running longer and more service could result in increased ridership. Route 71 should run 24/7. The 55 doesn't run on weekends. He suggested installing WiFi on all buses and advertising via PSAs on radio and television.

Ray Rogers, Cabrillo student, rides route 91X to get to his morning classes. The 71 or 69W takes longer.

Nahara Villalobos wants to be a police officer but can't if she can't get to Cabrillo to further her education. Currently rides route 91X.

Ayari Soto, Watsonville High School Life Skills Program representative, asked that routes 69A and 74 not be cut. 69A provides them with the ability to live in Independent Square and 74 provides transport to the Social Security office and the hospital. They need the ability to get to the Boardwalk and into the community to learn and grow. Placing 200 adults in an environment without transportation doesn't make sense. (See attached)

Mario Torres directed his comments to Chair Rotkin: You need to listen to the public. People are stressed and your mind is already set.

General Counsel Syren reminded the assembly that the purpose behind this agenda item is to open the public comment period and adopt a resolution setting the public hearing dates.

Chair Rotkin opened the floor for Board comments:

Director Dutra said he has met with a number of the public and held special meetings to relay their concerns to METRO. He agrees that route 91X is important and passing the Cabrillo student self-imposed \$40 fee would help. Shelters will need to be added, particularly if the wait time is increased. A number of riders noted that a shelter needs to be added at the Social Security office. Jimmy thanked the assembly and welcomed comments to his email: jimmy.dutra@cityofwatsonville.org

Director Friend departed at 11:51AM

Director Bottorff thanked the bus operators for their efforts at Cabrillo and assistance in passing out flyers. The Cabrillo fee will add revenue.

Director Leopold uses his newsletter and Facebook page to disseminate and receive information. He is pleased to see staff will continue to use STA and STIC funds for operating costs. The proposed RTC tax measure reflects a broad cross-section of transportation needs across the county; it is not reasonable to think that the funds received from this measure alone will solve METRO's structural deficit. Recommends little impact/change to routes 74, 1, 4, 69A, 71 and 91X. He asked that staff examine furloughs and other available options; e.g., UCSC may buy back some routes.

Director Chase reminded the assembly that today's staff report incorporates some changes which were suggested by the public. Route 4 to Emeline will be explored. Difficult decisions have to be made to meet the \$6.5M structural deficit challenge.

Director Hagen added that the METRO board functions on behalf of the public and the community.

Director Cervantez would like to prioritize access to education, health care, social services and jobs. She reiterated that route 69A provides access to Watsonville High School, Salud Para La Gente, the Freedom Boulevard corridor, the County Clinic and the hospital. The 91X provides access to education and the proposed changes would not travel before 6:00AM. Weekend service cuts could affect shopping and working hours for many.

Chair Rotkin said he wasn't trying to insult anyone and apologized for any unintentional slights. He requested that staff respond to the furlough inquiries, looking at each position to determine any savings which can be associated with furloughed positions keeping in mind that METRO has more essential positions than the City of Santa Cruz; e.g., services that keep buses and Paratransit on the road continue 24/7. METRO's fare recovery is better than the national average (23-25% vs 20%) which means that every ride is subsidized 80%. Cutting transit service is irrational; it's bad for environment and the public. The METRO Board cannot fix the problem alone; we need significant partners in the legislature and in the public.

Director Dutra departed at 12:02PM

ACTION: MOTION TO ACCEPT AND APPROVE THE UPDATE ON THE COMPREHENSIVE OPERATIONAL ANALYSIS AND ADOPT A RESOLUTION OPENING A 30-DAY PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD AND SET PUBLIC HEARINGS MAY 26, 2016 AND MAY 27, 2016 AS PRESENTED

MOTION: DIRECTOR HAGEN

SECOND: DIRECTOR LEOPOLD

MOTION PASSED WITH 7 AYES (Directors Bottorff, Cervantez, Chase, Hagen, Leopold, McPherson and Rotkin.) Director Bustichi, Dutra, Friend and Lane were absent.

CONSENT AGENDA

- 9-01 ACCEPT AND FILE: PRELIMINARY APPROVED CHECK JOURNAL DETAIL FOR THE MONTH OF MARCH 2016
- 9-02 ACCEPT AND FILE: THE YEAR TO DATE MONTHLY FINANCIAL REPORTS AS OF DECEMBER 31, 2015 AND JANUARY 31, 2016
- 9-03 ACCEPT AND FILE: MINUTES OF THE SANTA CRUZ METRO BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING OF MARCH 25, 2016
- 9-04 ACCEPT AND FILE: QUARTERLY STATUS REPORT OF ACTIVE GRANTS, GRANT APPLICATIONS AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR JANUARY – MARCH 2016
- 9-05 ACCEPT AND APPROVE: CONSIDERATION OF COMPLIMENTARY BUS PASSES BEING ISSUED AS A COMPONENT OF A MARKETING PROGRAM INTENDED TO ATTRACT NEW CUSTOMERS TO THE METRO SYSTEM
- 9-06 ACCEPT AND APPROVE: CONSIDERATION OF AUTHORIZING THE CEO TO EXECUTE A MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING WITH THE SANTA CRUZ COUNTY REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION REGARDING PARTICIPATION IN A USER-ORIENTED TRANSIT TRAVEL PLANNING PROJECT
- 9-07 ACCEPT AND FILE: CONSIDERATION OF METROBASE MONTHLY CHANGE ORDER REPORT
- 9-08 ACCEPT AND APPROVE: CONSIDERATION OF AWARD OF CONTRACT TO CONTRACT WEST ROOFING, INC. FOR SANTA CRUZ METRO ADMINISTRATION BUILDING ROOF REPLACEMENT NOT TO EXCEED \$102,400
- 9-09 ACCEPT AND APPROVE: TRANSFER AUTHORIZATION AND FUNDING FROM A FACILITIES MAINTENANCE WORKER I POSITION TO A CUSTODIAL SERVICE WORKER I POSITION IN THE FY16 BUDGET
- 9-10 ACCEPT AND APPROVE: CONSIDERATION OF DECLARING THREE (3) NEW FLYER BUSES AND ONE (1) FORD FOCUS AS EXCESS FOR PURPOSES OF DISPOSAL OR AUCTION

Chair Rotkin opened the floor to public comment regarding the Consent Agenda:

Elise Casby, regarding Agenda Item 9-04, said in her discussions with bus drivers, they appear to be unclear on some issues; e.g., grants. As a community, we need to be more proactive and aware of things.

Chair Rotkin clarified that many grants require federal matching funds which METRO doesn't have.

Unidentified woman suggested that Board Members and management accompany the public to meetings with legislative representatives. Chair Rotkin responded that METRO cannot use public funds to organize this type of function. Our local representatives are very supportive of transit.

ACTION: MOTION TO ACCEPT THE CONSENT AGENDA AS PRESENTED

MOTION: DIRECTOR LEOPOLD

SECOND: DIRECTOR DUTRA

MOTION PASSED WITH 7 AYES (Directors Bottorff, Cervantez, Chase, Hagen, Leopold, McPherson and Rotkin.) Director Bustichi, Dutra, Friend and Lane were absent.

REGULAR AGENDA

10 PRESENTATION OF EMPLOYEE LONGEVITY AWARDS FOR MICHELLE FITZPATRICK, BRUCE RHODES AND DAVID VALDEZ

As he introduced Michelle Fitzpatrick, Bus Operator with 20 years of service with METRO, he echoed the comments from many of the public who said our operators are extraordinary. Ms. Fitzpatrick thanked the Board and METRO administration. She said the drivers work hard to ensure the public gets to and from their destinations safely.

Bruce Rhodes, Fleet Maintenance Supervisor Mechanic, 15 years of service with METRO, thanked the Board and said he's enjoyed his challenges over his time with METRO.

David Valdez was not in attendance.

11 ACCEPT AND APPROVE: CONSIDERATION OF AWARD OF CONTRACT TO EAST BAY TIRE COMPANY FOR PURCHASE, DELIVERY AND SERVICES OF METRO'S REVENUE AND NON-REVENUE TIRES NOT TO EXCEED \$272,023

Al Pierce, Maintenance Manager provided background.

ACTION: MOTION TO ACCEPT AND APPROVE THE AWARD OF CONTRACT TO EAST BAY TIRE COMPANY FOR PURCHASE, DELIVERY AND SERVICING OF METRO'S REVENUE AND NON-REVENUE TIRES NOT TO EXCEED \$272,023 AS PRESENTED

MOTION: DIRECTOR LEOPOLD

SECOND: DIRECTOR McPHERSON

MOTION PASSED WITH 7 AYES (Directors Bottorff, Cervantez, Chase, Hagen, Leopold, McPherson and Rotkin.) Director Bustichi, Dutra, Friend and Lane were absent.

12 ACCEPT AND FILE: CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL OF A RESOLUTION SETTING FORTH THE CONDITIONS OF OFFERING A RETIREMENT AND SEPARATION INCENTIVE PROGRAM TO EMPLOYEES OF METRO

CEO Clifford explained that the program has been amended to include a cap. Staff has met with the unions and they have approved the changes.

Chair Rotkin added that we believe this incentive will be revenue positive.

ACTION: MOTION TO ACCEPT AND FILE: CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL OF A RESOLUTION SETTING FORTH THE CONDITIONS OF OFFERING A RETIREMENT AND SEPARATION INCENTIVE PROGRAM TO EMPLOYEES OF METRO AS PRESENTED.

MOTION: DIRECTOR LEOPOLD

SECOND: DIRECTOR McPHERSON

MOTION PASSED WITH 7 AYES (Directors Bottorff, Cervantez, Chase, Hagen, Leopold, McPherson and Rotkin.) Director Bustichi, Dutra, Friend and Lane were absent.

13 APPROVE AND ADOPT: CONSIDERATION OF ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION DECLARING A FISCAL EMERGENCY PURSUANT TO CEQA

District Counsel Syren reminded the Board that METRO did this last year. The effect is to exclude any fare or service changes from the CEQA process. This statute is specific to transit; METRO will obtain an exception due to inability to sustain a specific level of service.

ACTION: MOTION TO APPROVE AND ADOPT: CONSIDERATION OF ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION DECLARING A FISCAL EMERGENCY PURSUANT TO CEQA AS PRESENTED

MOTION: DIRECTOR LEOPOLD

SECOND: DIRECTOR BOTTORFF

MOTION PASSED WITH 7 AYES (Directors Bottorff, Cervantez, Chase, Hagen, Leopold, McPherson and Rotkin.) Director Bustichi, Dutra, Friend and Lane were absent.

15 ACCEPT: ORAL QUARTERLY REPORT OF STATE LEGISLATION AND CURRENT LEGISLATIVE ISSUES

Chair Rotkin granted Alex Clifford, CEO/General Manager, approval to combine agenda items 15 and 16.

16 CEO TO GIVE ORAL REPORT

AB090 (Alejo) bill would permit METRO (and other transit agencies) to use LCTOP funds to sustain operations rather than expansion projects once a fiscal emergency has been declared. The bill will next move to the assembly appropriations, assembly floor, assembly committee and then to Governor Brown for approval.

SB844 (Beall) would provide relief from the region-by-region requirement currently in place.

Special Session Legislation X11 (Beall) is being re-introduced. It may result in additional STA funds if the proposal to increase diesel fuel sales tax is successful.

STA program: Due to the recent formula change, METRO received fewer funds, a \$1.1M decrease. \$275K is related to new formula. A budget trailer bill is moving through the process to go back to prior year's allocation so that next 2 quarter allotments would be higher due to reversion to older formula. It has a lot of support and would allow for proper vetting.

AB2222 (Holden) proposes repurposing \$50M annually from the existing cap and trade program to fund free or reduced student passes. California Transit Association (CTA) is watching carefully as this doesn't provide any new funding, but takes from existing funds. The true intent of the bill is not clear at this time.

CEO Clifford will provide the Board with a written update.

CEO Clifford invited the board to attend the Judy K. Souza Operations Facility ribbon cutting on May 6, 2016 at 10:00AM.

He thanked staff, Board and members of the public for their assistance with the Cabrillo College self-imposed fee.

16 ORAL ANNOUNCEMENT OF NEXT MEETING: FRIDAY, MAY 13, 2016 AT 8:30 AM, SANTA CRUZ CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 809 CENTER STREET, SANTA CRUZ

18 ADJOURNMENT

Chair Rotkin announced the next meeting as above.

Meeting adjourned at 12:41PM by Chair Rotkin.

Respectfully submitted,

Gina Pye
Executive Assistant

Orange County's Bus Ridership Declines Are Worst in Socal



Kaitlin Washburn for Voice of OC

An Orange County Transportation Authority bus in Santa Ana.

By Thy Vo January 25

LIKE | WEET | EMAIL | PRINT | MORE

While the number of people riding public buses took a hit nationwide after the Great Recession, bus ridership is falling faster in Orange County than other Southern California counties, dropping by nearly 30 percent since 2008.

One of the biggest factors driving that decline? Service cuts.

When the Orange County Transportation Authority made its cuts, the agency focused on spreading them out relatively equally across the county, rather than cutting based on ridership.

This approach turned out to be a mistake. While transit agencies throughout the nation had to cut services due to declining revenues in the wake of the Great Recession, few saw ridership drop like it did in Orange County.

DISTRIBUTED AT 4/22/16 BOARD MEETING

November 2015 marked 36 straight months of declining bus ridership for the Transportation Authority, with 20 million fewer boardings a year since 2008.

Over the same time period, bus ridership fell by 11 percent in Los Angeles Metropolitan Transportation Authority and 3 percent for Omnitrans, the bus system serving San Bernardino County.

Meanwhile, ridership increased by 6 percent for the San Diego Metropolitan Transportation System and by 16 percent for the Riverside Transit Agency.

Click on image to view an interactive graph in a new window.

Now the agency is proposing changes that would cut low-performing routes concentrated in south county and shift those resources toward improving services along more frequented routes in denser, central county cities.

"What we've heard from our riders is they really want more frequent service and service that gets them to go where they need to quickly," said Transportation Authority spokesman Joel Zlotnik. "What OCTA is proposing...would put limited resources where they're most needed, create a more efficient and cost-effective transit system."

A 'Vicious Cycle'

Cutting bus service can be a "vicious cycle," says Jacob Anbinder, communications assistant for the New York-based nonprofit TransitCenter who has studied falling bus ridership nationwide.

As agencies cut bus services to relieve their budgets, fewer people ride the bus, further exacerbating revenue woes, Anbinder said. This scenario certainly played out in Orange County.

The number of buses operating at peak hours in went from 541 in 2008 to 428 in 2013, a 21 percent decrease, according to data from the National Transit Database. Over that same period, hours of service were cut by 21 percent.

The Transportation Authority also increased fares by 50 cents, from \$1.50 to \$2.00 a ride, in 2013.

"What that basically says to me is you will have as many riders as your provision of good service can reach. The cuts and the decline in ridership seems directly related to the cuts in service," Anbinder said.

	Change in Vehicle Revenue Hours	Change in Vehicles Operated During Peak
Orange County	-21.07%	-20.89%
Riverside	-12.92%	-17.61%
San Diego	-8.79%	0.24%
San Bernardino	-3.11%	3.60%
Los Angeles	-11.93%	-16.74%

Table: Cuts to Bus Service between 2008 and 2013

This played out in other Southern California counties as well. In Los Angeles County, where ridership has fallen by 11 percent, the agency has cut bus hours by nearly 12 percent.

In San Bernardino, a 3 percent cut in bus service since 2008 is about on par with the 3 percent decline in ridership. Omnitrans spokeswoman Wendy Williams attributed the decline in part to a 25-cent fare increase that went into effect in Sept. 2014.

In Riverside County, although the transportation agency has cut bus service hours by nearly 13 percent since 2008, ridership fell by just 2.6 percent in 2010 and has since increased by more than 18 percent above pre-recession levels.

Brad Weaver, a spokesman for the Riverside Transit Agency, attributed this steady increase in bus boardings to the success of an unlimited bus pass for college students paid for through their college tuition.

Although a number of conditions factor into ridership numbers -- like population density, demographics and gas prices -- many in the transit world see the quality of service as the number one factor. And that has been a problem in Orange County.

The Transportation Authority has handed over an increasing number of routes to contractors in recent years, leading to a big spike in complaints about busses that don't show up. Between August and Oct. 21, the Transportation Authority recorded 42 "missed trips."

Researchers at San Jose State University's Mineta Transportation Institute found in a May 2015 study that, when you control for those other factors, service levels are the strongest predictor of bus ridership.

"If buses don't run as frequently...and they cut back service in terms of length of routes, people simply aren't going to ride," Anbinder said.

But balancing the level of service with the needs of the population is difficult.

"Every agency faces this trade-off: we have a limited pot of money, do we spread it around evenly and send a bus an hour to every neighborhood...or should we concentrate on a few routes in some areas?" said Anbinder.

While the right answer depends on each city, Anbinder said the new route changes appear to move toward industry best practices -- away from a "social services" model of transportation focused on serving as many neighborhoods as possible.

"A bus that runs every hour is, at a certain point, not useful. There's a recognition [in the transit world] that if you spread service so thin, it becomes virtually unusable," Anbinder said. "Even for people who are desperate, if it's not usable, they'll find another way."

The Transportation Authority official hopes the new changes -- which, if approved, will go into effect starting in June -- will boost ridership by 1.6 million boardings over the next three years.

The proposed changes cut routes largely located in Southern Orange County, as well as two routes that service Santa Ana, which has the highest boarding density in Orange County.

The plan increases the frequency of service along several busy routes and adds two Bravo! express buses.

The Transportation Authority is also launching a small marketing campaign to boost ridership, including new branding on buses themselves, promotional videos aimed at young people, direct mailers, and a new mobile ticketing app that would allow riders to buy fares on their smartphones.

While time will tell whether these efforts improve ridership, Anbinder said bus service still takes a back seat in Orange County when it comes transit priorities.

"Cities and regions are investing heavily in car infrastructure, publicly and privately. In Orange County, the transportation priority for spending is widening the freeway," Anbinder said. "You're paying people to drive. People who have a choice choose to drive, because that's what the transportation investment has prioritized."

What is the Transportation Initiative?

The Initiative proposes that a transportation fee of \$40 per student per semester (\$20 for the summer semester) be collected from all students to provide students with 7-days per week, semester-long bus pass valid for travel on METRO buses throughout Santa Cruz County.

Important Points:

- The fee will be assessed on all students, except Stroke Center students.
- The Bus Pass allows 7-days per week travel on METRO buses throughout Santa Cruz County and transfers to designated Monterey-Salinas Transit services. The Highway 17 Express to San Jose is excluded.
- The fee would be implemented in the Fall 2016.
- The fee doesnot cover the cost of the optional campus parking permit.
- METRO will provide the Student Senate with two-per-semester, internal bus advertising placement on all buses for no cost, for sanctioned student events.

What happens if I vote YES?

- You could potentially save upto \$200-\$285 a semester and \$476-\$680 a year.
- The Student Senate will work with METRO to develop a recommendation regarding service priorities, and for use of the fee in implementing additional bus service to corridors providing students' access to Cabrillo College. The recommendation will be subject to the METRO Board's approval.
- You will benefit the community by helping reduce traffic congestion and production of greenhouse gases, and support METRO efforts to evolve its fleet to sustainable fuels, including electric buses.
- You would be helping fellow students who are dependent on public transit for their mobility.
- You could reduce traffic congestion and parking problems by switching to the bus instead of driving to school.



What happens if I vote NO?

- METRO will face more severe service reductions, leading to job cuts, unemployment and reduced frequency of bus service.
- Students who rely on public transportation will have to pay upto \$325 per semester to be able to get to and from school.
- Students who rely on public transportation to get to school may have a considerable hardship when scheduling classes around a reduced bus service schedule.
- Reduced frequency of buses will cause more students to drive to school, causing increased parking and traffic congestion.

Where and How to Vote:

Please follow the ASCC Student Senate website below get information on the polling locations and times:

<https://www.cabrillo.edu/associations/studentssenate/>



What is this about?

Students are currently paying \$240-\$325 per semester buying monthly bus passes. METRO, the Santa Cruz County public bus service, is facing major service reductions due to funding shortfalls.

Your vote for a transportation fee of \$40 per student* per semester (\$20 for the summer semester) -- similar to the Student Health Fee -- would give students* a semester-long METRO bus pass valid for travel on all local METRO routes throughout the Santa Cruz County. It would also provide additional funding to METRO, which would help lessen service reductions in the Fall.

*except Stroke Center Students



Cabrillo College Spring Ballot 2016

Vote YES! to SAVE The Environment to SAVE Money

The Transportation Initiative



April 18, 2016

Dear S.C. Metro,

Please do not cut the 69A.

We use it for class trips.

We use it for work/especially at the b walk

We will not be able to get on the bus at
W.H.S.

Wheelchair students/special needs
students will have to go to the Metro
station. Some students won't be able to go
that far to catch other buses.

Handwritten scribble

*Stella
Laukallason*

Special Needs Students @ W.H.S

Danny Lopez *Mena Vasquez*

Ayari Soto

Ernie

Misulchenas

Chris Martinez

Handwritten scribble

Handwritten scribble

- THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK -